

A COMPARATIVE STUDY ON WOMEN'S BETRAYAL IN JUNG CHANG'S *WILD SWANS* AND ATIQ RAHIMI'S *THE PATIENCE STONE*

Muhammad Thoriqussuud¹, Fathur Rohim², Abu Fanani³, Akhmad Syaikh⁴, Atiq
Mohammad Romdlon⁵

¹thoriqussuud@uinsa.ac.id, ²fathurrohim0169@gmail.com, ³abufanani@yahoo.com,

⁴syaikhu.aljawi@gmail.com, ⁵atiqramadhan67@gmail.com

^{1,2,3,4,5}UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya

Received: 16th July 2024

Revised: 2nd December 2024

Accepted: 25th December 2024

ABSTRACT This study is comparing women's betrayal in two novels, *Wild Swans* a novel by Jung Chang and *the Patience Stone* a novel by Atiq Rahimi. The fact that Chinese' women and Afghan women's share the common issue, that is patriarchal one, the former faces the superior communist party, whilst, the latter faces the Mullah, the influential spiritual leader. Then, the women's betrayal is worthy of analysis. The word 'betrayal' turns out to have a positive connotation instead of a negative one as heard in everyday life. Using descriptive and dramatic method, the study finds that both women in both novels have similarities and differences in their betrayal seen from the way they speak as well as act. In the similarities, both women betray the powerful people and their husbands, whilst, the differences are that people in power refer to the political parties in *Wild Swans*, a novel by Jung Chang, to the Mullah, a religious leader in *the Patience Stone*, a novel by Atiq Rahimi besides the husband is loyal to the political party in *Wild Swans* and to the religious teaching in *the Patience Stone*. Eventually, comparing women's betrayal is worth a study since their betrayal gives a new life concept that women should play important roles in society not just men.

Keywords: betrayal, comparative study, close reading, husband, powerful people

INTRODUCTION

Betrayal, a word familiar with people in everyday life turns out to have attraction from the experts to define; Priemel (2016), in his book *The Betrayal, The Nuremberg Trials and German Divergence*, gives example about betrayal; the unhappy story of physicians that has ignored their skilled integrities; of public officials that has been unfaithful to democracy; of militaries that has run away from their instruction code; of men of business that has gone away from fair competition as well as the free-market economy.

Akerstrom (2017), in his book *Betrayal and Betrayers the Sociology of Treachery*, comes up with the idea of social types of betrayal. First, the spy, the reliable diplomat that unexpectedly shares data to the enemy. Second, the scabs, the employees that are not with the strike. Third, the snitch, the informant in felonious groups. Fourth, the revealer, the reliable fellow worker that abruptly chooses to expose black mysteries from his work. The last, the collaborators, those that are hand in hand with the opponent during battles.

Kolakowski (2018) in *Freedom, Fame, Lying and Betrayal Essays on Everyday Life* categorizes loyalty into three, loyalty to nation, loyalty to religion, and royalty to political party. People have no choice for the former as nature has selected for them. Whilst, to latter and to the last, people can choose them and when both of them cannot satisfy them, people betray them.

Romilly (2019) in *the Life of Alcibiades Dangerous Ambition and the Betrayal of Athens* considers that a private fight between a soldier and the leader at the expense of the country as a public betrayal because the fight may cause the country in crisis. It turns out that betrayal can also happens to the racial when a black person feels uncomfortable living in an area of black community (Boisseron, 2014), to sex (Gartner, 2018), and to liberal economics (Witztum, 2019).

In a nutshell, the researcher comes to the understanding that there are kinds of betrayal, two of which are suitable for this study, that is, betrayal of the political party and the religion.

Of the religion, the researcher does not mean that the betrayer embraces another one but the betrayer is against the specific religious teaching. Therefore, the researcher applies the understanding of betrayal of the political party and the religion into two works of literature since literature is the picture of real life. The literary works the researcher chooses belong to Jung Chang's *Wild Swans* and Atiq Rahimi's *the Patience Stone*.

Wild Swans is a novel of autobiography that narrates three daughters of China, namely, the grandmother, the mother, and the daughter who then call themselves as wild swans. The narrator of the novel is the daughter who narrates the mother dealing with two political parties, the Communist Party and the Kuomintang Party. For some reasons, the mother betrays the two political parties, consequently, her life is full of conflict against the two parties that also leads the conflicts to her married life. The narrator then names herself as I in the novel.

The Patience Stone is an Afghan novel reflecting the social life of women under the strict religious regulation as well as male. The researcher uses the term women here representing a wife whose every action is under the rule of the Mullah as well as her husband. For some reasons, the woman betrays her husband and the Mullah that leads the conflicts to her whole lifetime.

To come to the understanding of both novels above, the researcher uses close reading theory that the researcher understands the work from the revelation of the work itself; the words that are described by the author and spoken by the characters, also figures of speech such as *metaphors*, *images* as well as *symbols* are priority to the researcher to analyze deeply. In other words, close reading refers to things within the works without considering things beyond the works like the life of the author etc (Pickering, 2019). After reading closely of the two novels, the researcher, then, considers that there are similarities and differences in the women's betrayal above, therefore, the researcher compares their betrayal in this study.

The novel, *the Patience Stone*, turns out to have attraction from some authors to study, recently. Abdul Wali Yawari (2020) studies about the Woman in the Novel, *the Patience Stone*, defines the woman as no sooner having been faceless and voiceless than giving her total disquiet to a man to grieve as much as her. Fanani, et. al (2022), in their article *Social Struggle in Atiq Rahimi's the Patience Stone*, describes woman as being in conflicts against the inside society as well as the outside one. By the use of social conflict theory as well as theme and plot, the woman is found in the middle of social struggle in theme as well as in plot from the introduction to the solution.

Probowati (2017) in her article *Afghan Domestic Women as Represented in Khalid Hosseini's A Thousand Splendid Suns and Atiq Rahimi's the Patience Stone*, analyzes the impacts of the males' tyranny over the women. Through the use of theory of feminism, the finding shows that the women are depressed, anxious, traumatic, and dead. .

Sodiq (2023) in his study on *Feminism in Jung Chang's Wild Swans*, analyzes feminism as the result of men's power of economies and societies, elimination of sexual aspiration, and rights. Using closing reading and theory of feminism, the result of the study shows that the woman strives for contribution to thrifts as well as humanities, abolition of sexual target of the womanly existence to achieve a more seriousness of the equivalence with men, as well as females attainment about identical privileges.

It is clear that in the previous studies above, though all researchers, that is, Yawari, Fanani, Probawati, and Sodiq analyze women in their article, however, the focus of the women's part is unlike the researcher's study. All women in the previous studies above are the victims of men's power, whilst, the women in the researcher's study are in clash against men through their betrayal. The betrayal idea is the impact of the emptiness in the previous studies above that the researcher then regards as the recommendation to raise as the topic that also becomes the gap of this study. This is the researcher's excuse to come to the topic of this study

as follows: A Comparative Study on Women's Betrayal in Jung Chang's *Wild Swans* and Atiq Rahimi's *the Patience Stone* in spite of the fact that through studying the women's betrayal, the researcher comes to the understanding that not all betrayal connotes to the negative meaning.

Thus, the previous studies above give the researcher a vivid understanding that what the women do against men reveals positive meaning since feminism is to raise women in the same level as men. The researcher's study also gives positive meaning though using the term betrayal as the women's betrayal in the two novels is for the sake for humanity. Besides, betrayal is not found in the previous studies above which then leads the researcher to come to the questions as follows; how are the betrayal described and what are the similarities and the differences of their betrayal? The researcher then elaborates the women's betrayal and performs the similarities and the differences of the betrayal. Thus, through the research question and objective of the study, the study meets the need for the novelty.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The researcher uses the comparative theory that comparative refers to similarities and differences with the compared works (Yunita, & Anggraini, 2020; Muhandra, et.al., 2024; Javed et.al., 2023; Naeem & Khushk, 2022; Ali & Khan, 2023; Latifah, 2023; Luzae, et.al., 2023; Sarah et.al., 2022; Naeem & Khushk, 2022). Comparative also refers to merely similarities within the works (Golab et.al., 2020; Hasan, 2022; Sultana, 2020; Hefandia et.al., 2023, Khaliq et.al., 2023) as well as merely to differences (Kadir et.al., 2022, Eesa et.al., 2023). The researcher uses the first meaning since it challenges the previous studies above. Study on Jung Chang's *Wild Swans* and Atiq Rahimi's *the Patience Stone* that has been conducted by Yawari (2020), Fanani (2022), Probowati (2017), and Sodiq (2023) deals with women closely related to oppression that they want to get away from it. Whilst, the researcher's study exposes the women's oppression in other words, the researcher develops this study into the action of the women that disagree with men's action, the betrayal.

Besides, to get deep understanding, the researcher uses close reading through denotative and connotative meaning. The former refers to textual meaning, whilst, the latter refers to the researcher's feeling based on his experiences.

RESEARCH METHODS

Research Approach

A qualitative descriptive method is worthy of an application in this study by which the researcher means to define the problem and examine how the research happens and the influencing factors (Nassaji 2015). Further, qualitative descriptive method advances profound observation in understanding the studies that are not yet comprehensible, whereas there are many things worthy of detailed investigation. Similarly, qualitative descriptive method is a perfect strategy to analyse the social aspect of research (Rutberg & Bouikidis, 2018). Then, through this method, the researcher compare women's betrayal in Jung Chang's *Wild Swans* and Atiq Rahimi's *the Patience Stone*.

Data Collection

Insomuch as the researcher uses literary work to study, then the instrument of the study is the researcher himself in that the researcher does the collection of the data in two tables in a note; the first part of the data is Jung Chang's *Wild Swans* and the second part is Atiq Rahimi's *the Patience Stone*. The researcher makes another tables for the similarities and the differences of the characters' speech and action. Consequently, this kind of data collection makes the researcher easy to analyze and compare the problems.

Data Analysis

In novel analysis, nobody can get away from the description, the discussion, and the reporting speech as well as the action of the character, consequently, the researcher uses descriptive and dramatic method in this study. By descriptive and dramatic method, the researcher means to elaborate and compare the characters, in that the researcher elaborate the similarities and the differences of the women's betrayal in the two novels. The similarities and the differences are from their speaking and action related to their betrayal.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

In this section, the researcher highlights the women's betrayal and performs the similarities and the differences of the betrayal in Jung Chang's *Wild Swans* and Atiq Rahimi's *the Patience Stone*.

Jung Chang's *Wild Swans*

As explained above that the woman experiences political attachment in two political parties, the Kuomintang and the Communist. Nevertheless, she judges both political parties objectively. She has to betray her loyalty when she sees something odd to her opinion. It happens when she sticks her loyalty to the Kuomintang, she betrays the party when the party disregards unfairly the other party, the Communist. Therefore, the communists become her alternative of her loyalty as they promise the community a better future life, no longer the Kuomintang. She even opens war against Kuomintang, "The only alternative she knew was the Communists, and she had been particularly attracted by their promises to put an end to injustices against woman" (Chang, 1991). Besides, the Kuomintang kills those who do not belong to them and it happens to her cousin named Hu who has been put to death by Kuomintang, therefore, "she approached Yu-Fu about working for the Communists" (Chang, 1991:101).

The betrayal of the woman does not stop to the Kuomintang party. She still continues her betrayal to the party she was just attached her loyalty to, the Communist party. It happens when the Communist party does not fulfill her expectation that teachers should have been made prosperous. Her respect to the teacher's existence has been seen since in the era of Kuomintang. She struggles for the prosperity of the teacher no matter what political party the teacher is with, as long as they are the teachers, they deserve more respects, "My mother placed too much importance on professional merit rather than 'class back ground'" (Chang, 1991).

In spite of betraying the political party for others outside of herself, the woman betrays the political party's rule for herself. It happens when the Communist party does not respect the life of the individuals especially the members. Through the Cultural Revolution's policy issued by the Communist party, husbands and wives are not allowed to spend the night together. This policy then arises the woman's betrayal against the party. "What harm could it do the Revolution if she spent the night with her husband?" (Chang, 1991).

It turns out that the woman not only betrays the political party but also her husband. Though the woman and her husband are quite loyal to the party of Communists, however, her husband's loyalty has no limits that leads her to her betrayal. He does not care for the wife for the sake of the party that raises the woman's/his wife's infidelity to him. To the woman, the Cultural Revolution's is beyond humanity that when the woman as the wife needs her husband's help of her being in a serious problem of her pregnancy, her husband ignores her, "You are a good Communist but a rotten Husband!" (Chang, 1991). The researcher regards the woman's words to her husband as a kind of betrayal since a wife must obey what her husband wants her to do though to her thought, her husband is in the ability of helping her since he has been in the top position in the party. However, the Cultural Revolution's rule talks otherwise that should be obeyed by the member.

Atiq Rahimi's *the Patience Stone*

In *the Patience Stone*, the woman betrays two kinds of person, the Mullah and the husband, both of whom are people that should be obeyed, the former obeyed by the people and the latter obeyed by the wife/the woman. As commonly understood that the Mullah, a person in chief in Islamic teaching has respects by the disciples in that the disciples must obey the Mullah's words in relation to the Islamic teaching, whilst, the husband gets respects by the wife. The woman's betrayal against the Mullah happens when the Mullah orders her to read one of the Asmaul Husna of God within ninety-nine times a day for ninety-nine days, due to husband's recovery from the wound of war, but then the woman feels burdened to go on the reciting since it does not work yet and the husband ignores her that to the woman's viewpoint, it is unfair.

"That I must recite one of the ninety-nine names of God ninety-nine times a day...for ninety-nine days! But that stupid Mullah has no idea what it's like to be alone with a man who..." (Rahimi, 2010).

It seems that the husband always neglects the woman as his wife even though he stays at home close to his wife. The wife's suffering from his neglect grows more when he goes out of the house for a war. Through the husband's behaviors that inconvenience her, the woman then betrays the Mullah's instruction of the reciting. "The woman arrives to gaze anxiously at the man. Perhaps, she is afraid that the call to arms will have put him back on his feet" (Rahimi, 2010). The woman cannot stand hearing the sound of the war proved by the fact that the fire of the gun as well as the tank's moan without her house when her husband lies paralyzed in bed. Therefore, she is so scared that she minds her husband going out of the house

The other betrayal by the woman is against the husband. As commonly known that a wife must be loyal to her husband instead of the others such as her aunt, however, the woman is loyal to her aunt. Though her aunt helps her in her difficulty, yet, as a wife she must take care of her husband thoughtfully, "I don't care," what you think of her..." far, "I love her", near, "she's all I have left... My sisters have abandoned me, and your brothers, too..." (Rahimi, 2010).

Further betrayal of the woman against the husband is an adultery. Married life is a sacred life in that the sexual connection between the husband and wife is considered to be sacred too. Even though the husband has problems in doing sexual course with his wife, it does not mean that the wife freely has a sexual course with other. She can demand a divorce to an Islamic judge instead of doing an adultery.

"At least, with him, I can tell him what to do and how to do it. If I'd asked all that of you...my God! I'd have got a broken nose!" (Rahimi, 2010).

The quote above indicates that the husband is in a terrible condition, by lying ill in bed, it means that he is not able to drive his sex for the woman's sake. As a respond to her husband's paralyzing, she invites a young boy to have sexual intercourse with her though she has to teach the boy everything about sex. This is a betrayal. The wife should have stayed patient as married life is a holy life, nobody can interfere with it. It is what the Quran states that married life is quite tight.

The last betrayal against her husband is to show the adultery result to her husband. It turns out that in that area, the infertile wife is sent out in exile far from family, to be a whore. To prove that she is fertile, she does further adultery and bears two children (Rahimi, 2010). "Yes, my Sange-e Sabur, those two girls are not yours! And do you know why? Because you were the infertile one. Not me!" (Rahimi, 2010). The quotation clearly shows that the woman does betray her husband. Though the husband has no capability to do anything, the wife must have been patient or she can demand a divorce to the Islamic judge not doing something sinful, something that every religion bans to do, an adultery.

The Similarities and Differences

The similarities of the betrayal conducted by the two women in the different novels seem to run as follows: first of all, both women betray powerful people. The researcher regards that the government, that is, the political party of Kuomintang as well as the political party of the Communists are full of powerful people that through their policy the people are driven. One of the indications of the driven people is that the woman in Jun Chang’s *Wild Swans* advances protests against policy of the teacher’s prosperity and the Cultural Revolution (Chang, 1991). In Atiq Rahimi’s *the Patience Stone*, the powerful one refers to the Mullah whose fatwas are always obeyed by the people though sometimes the fatwas are disappointing the people, in this case, the woman (Rahimi, 2010).

Table 1. The similaritoes and Differences between Jung Chang’s Wild Swans and Atiq Rahimi’s the Patience Stone

The Similarities of Betrayal	
Betraying powerful people	
Betraying their husbands	
The Differences of Betrayal	
Jung Chang’s Wild Swans	Atiq Rahimi’s the Patience Stone
Against Political Party	Against Religious leader
The Husband’s Loyalty to the Political Party	The Husband’s Loyalty to Religious Teaching

Second of all, both women betray their husbands. The researcher regards that the women in both novels have no more loyalty to their husbands when their husbands’ policy do not meet their interest. In every religion’s teaching, a woman should not disobey her husband though it is burdening to her as long as it is not a sinful thing. When the husband obeys the government’s policy about a momentary separate life, the woman curses him (Chung, 1991), whilst, when the husband leaves her to a war, the woman is angry with him (Rahimi, 2010).

Whilst, the differences of the betrayal conducted by the two women in the different novels run as follows: the powerful people in Jung Chang’s *Wild Swans* belong to the political party. It is clear that the woman in the first novel is in confront against two political parties, the Kuomintang and the Communist (Chang, 1991), whilst, the second novel, the woman is against the religious leader, the Mullah (Rahimi, 2010). The other difference is that the husband the woman deals with is quite loyal to his political party till he forgets his wife (Chang, 1991), whilst, in Atiq Rahimi’s *the Patience Stone*, the husband is quite loyal to his religion’s teaching about a war as jihad till he forgets his wife (Rahimi, 2010).

All in all, the women in both novels have something in common that they dare to betray against the others for the truth they believe. In Jung Chang’s *Wild Swans*, the woman is in the front place to defend the existence of the teachers though it can ruin her life, whilst, in Atiq Rahimi’s *the Patience Stone*, the woman is against the Mullah, though it cannot ruin her physic, yet, the Mullah is a respectable person, worthy of admiration.

CONCLUSION

In this sub-title, the researcher divides into two, that is, the conclusion of the findings as well as discussions and the researcher’s hope of the further study. First of all, the researcher finds a new connotation of betrayal that it can have a positive connotation instead of negative one. The researcher regards so as what the women do is for the sake of others as well as their safety. The similarities of the women’s betrayal go to the objects they betray that they betray

powerful people and their husbands. Whilst, the differences are that the powerful people belong to the political party in *Wild Swans*, to the religion leader in *the Patience Stone*. The husband is loyal to the political party in *Wild Swans*, whilst, in *the Patience Stone*, the husband is loyal to the Mullah, the religion leader. From the similarities and the differences as well as from the finding that are excluded from the previous studies above, this study has the novelty.

Second of all, the researcher is in a condition of considerable hope that there are researchers conducting studies on the same novels with different theories/approaches in order that there are more novelties generated from the two novels. Through such effort then the literary study develops quickly.

REFERENCES

- Akerstrom, M. (2017). *Betrayal and betrayers: The sociology of treachery*. Routledge.
- Ali, S., & Khan, A.A. (2023). A Comparative Study of Ahmad Ali's *Twilight in Delhi* and Edgar Morgan Forsters *A Passage to India: A Feminist Perspective*. *Global Language Review*, VIII(I), 131-138. [https://doi.org/10.31703/glr.2023\(VIII-I\).13](https://doi.org/10.31703/glr.2023(VIII-I).13)
- Boisseron, B. (2022). *Creole Renegades: Rhetoric of Betrayal and Guilt in the Caribbean Diaspora*. University Press of Florida.
- Chang, J. (2008). *Wild swans: Three daughters of China*. Simon and Schuster.
- Eesa, M.R., Saad, A.M., & Sahib, M.A. (2023). The Concept of Marriage in Different Cultures: A Comparative Study. *Manar Elsharq Journal for Literature and Language Studies*, 1(3), 29-34. <https://doi.org/10.56961/mejlls.v1i3.495>
- Fanani, A., Zaidun, A., & Amiq. (2022). Social Struggle in Atiq Rahimi's *the Patience Stone* An Article. *Lingustic, Literature and English Education*, 2(1), 21-35. <https://doi.org/10.55526/lie.v1i1.300>
- Gartner, R.B. (Ed.). (2017). *Understanding the sexual betrayal of boys and men: The trauma of sexual abuse*. Routledge.
- Golab, G., Anosheh, S. M., & Jahantigh, H. (2020). A Comparative Study of Love in Emerson's Essays and Attar's *The Conference of the Birds*. *International Journal of Linguistics, Literature and Translation*, 3(7), 154-162. <https://doi.org/10.32996/ijllt.2020.3.7.18>
- Hasan, M. (2022). T.S. Eliot's Modern Style as Reflected in Sherko Bekas's Poem "A Fall Letter": A Comparative Study. *Comparative Literature: East & West*, 6(2), 139-153. <https://doi.org/10.1080/25723618.2022.2143073>
- Hefandia, D. A., Kusuma, D. L., & Ruslianti, A. (2023). Women Empowerment in Comparison to Asian Female Gender Roles and Stereotypes in *Crazy Rich Asians* Novel. *Journal of Languages and Language Teaching*, 11(4), 933-942. <https://doi.org/10.33394/jollt.v11i4.8737>
- Javed, M.A., Asif, A., & Mumtaz, S.A. A Comparison of Arriving Death in Collectivistic versus Individualistic Protagonists in Leo Tolstoy's "The Death of Ivan Ilyich" and Khalida Hussain's "Hazarpaya". *Journal of Xi'an Shiyou University, Natural Science Edition*, 19 (5), 1394-1404.
- Kadir, R., Sahril, S., & Nurfadhilah, A.S. (2022). Comparative analysis of gender related issues in the novel *the age of innocence* by edith warthon and *big little lies* by liane miroarte. *Eliterate: Journal of English Linguistics and Literature Studies*, 2(1), 38-47.
- Khaliq, N., & Ghaffar, F. (2023). Unravelling the Intricacies of Love and Hatred: A Comparative Analysis of the Classic 'Romeo and Juliet' and Hashim Nadeem's Contemporary Drama 'Khuda Aur Muhabbat Season 3'. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 11(4), 4457-4464. <https://doi.org/10.52131/pjhss.2023.1104.0711>

- Kolakowski, L. (2019). *Freedom, fame, lying and betrayal: Essays on everyday life*. Routledge.
- Latifah, A., (2023): A Portrait of Loss in Song Lyrics and the Film *Kukira Kau Rumah: A Comparative Literary Study*, *LOGAT Journal Bahasa Indonesia dan Pembelajaran*, 10 (1), 94-109. <https://doi.org/10.36706/logat.v10i1.688>
- Luzae, L., Setijowati, A., & Afdholy, N. (2023). Comparison of Women and Prostitution in *Woman at Point Zero* and *Tuhan Izinkan Aku Menjadi Pelacur*. *Anaphora: Journal of Language, Literary, and Cultural Studies*, 6(2), 90-102. <https://doi.org/10.30996/anaphora.v6i2.9662>
- Muhandra, A.P., Maharani, A.P., br Barus, C.M., Putri, D.A., & Ningsih, A.M. (2024). Comparison of the black cat myth in america and in indonesia through the novel "the black cat" by edgar allan poe. *PHILOLOGY Journal of English Language and Literature*, 4(1), 1-6. <https://doi.org/10.32696/pjell.v4i1.2821>
- Naeem, A., & Khushk, M. (2022). A Comparative study of feministic approaches 'My Feudal Lord' by Tehmina Durani and 'The Broken Wings' by Kahlil Gibran. *International Research Journal of Education and Innovation*, 3(2), 280–290. Retrieved from <https://irjei.com/index.php/irjei/article/view/184>
- Nassaji, H. (2015). Qualitative and descriptive research: Data type versus data analysis. *Language Teaching Research*, 19(2), 129-132. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1362168815572747>
- Pickering, S. (2011). Close Reading. In *Dreamtime: A Happy Book* (pp. 92–97). University of South Carolina Press. <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv6wggx8.14>
- Priemel, K.C. (2018). *The betrayal: The Nuremberg trials and German divergence*. Oxford University Press.
- Probowati, Y. (2019). Afghan Domestic Women as Represented In Khaled Hosseini's *Thousand Splendid Suns* and Atiq Rahimi's *The Patience Stone*. *JEELL (Journal of English Education, Linguistics and Literature) English Departement of STKIP PGRI Jombang*, 3(2) 38-44. <https://doi.org/10.32682/jeel.v3i2.658>
- Rahimi, A., (2010). *The Patience Stone*. Chatto & Windus.
- Romilly, J.d., (2019). *The Life of Alcibiades Dangerous Ambition and the Betrayal of Athens*. Cornell University Press Ithaca and London
- Rutberg, S., & Bouikidis, C. D. (2018). Focusing on the fundamentals: A simplistic differentiation between qualitative and quantitative research. *Nephrology Nursing Journal*, 45(2), 209-213.
- Sarah, R., & Pramita, A. (2022). The Woman Struggle In The Novel *Jane Eyre* By Charlotte Bronte And Entrok By Okky Madasari: Comparative Literature. *CaLLs (Journal of Culture, Arts, Literature, and Linguistics)*, 8(2), 161-178. <http://dx.doi.org/10.30872/calls.v8i2.7693>
- Sodiq, M.M. (2023). FEMINISM IN JUNG CHANG'S *WILD SWANS*. *JEELL (Journal of English Education, Linguistics and Literature) English Departement of STKIP PGRI Jombang*, 10(1), 82-93. <https://doi.org/10.32682/jeell.v10i1.3203>
- Sultana, T. (2020). Hawthorne's *Dimmesdale* and Waliullah's *Majeed* Are Not Charlatan: A Comparative Study in the Perspective of Destabilized Socio-Religious Psychology. *English Language and Literature Studies*, 10(3). <https://doi.org/10.5539/ells.v10n3p1>
- Witztum, A., (2019). *The Betrayal of Liberal Economics*. Palgrave Macmillan
- Yawari, A.W. (2020). The woman in the novel, the patience stone (syngue sabour). *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications (IJSRP)*, 10(2), 435-438. <http://dx.doi.org/10.29322/IJSRP.10.02.2020.p9860>

Yunita, G.F.R., & Anggraini, P. (2020). Comparative study of nasionalism main characters in the novel *Negeri van Oranje* and *Diary Buruh Migran*. *Aksis: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa dan Sastra Indonesia*, 4(2), 230-251. <https://doi.org/10.21009/AKSIS.040201>